## Electrons and phonons in twisted bilayer graphene

### Twistronics 2023 International Workshop on twisted bilayer graphene and beyond

University of Seoul, Seoul, Korea, January 11<sup>th</sup> ~ 13<sup>th</sup>, 2023

## F. Guinea

### Outline

- Long range interactions in twisted bilayer graphene.
- Bands and Fermi Surface pinning.
- Broken symmetry phases.
- Long range interactions and superconductivity.





In colaboration with N. R. Walet, R. Brown, (U. Manchester), T. Cea, P. Pantaleon, (Imdea). Also V. P. Phong (U. Penn), V. Crépel, L. Fu, L. Levitov (MIT), S. Yuan (Wuhan U.), J. Lischner, Z. Goodwin (Imperial C.).

## Superconductivity in graphene

## Superconductivity in graphene. March Meeting, Los Angeles 2018

### nature Accelerated Article Preview

#### LETTER

doi:10.1038/nature26154

### Correlated insulator behaviour at half-filling in magic-angle graphene superlattices

Yuan Cao, Valla Fatemi, Ahmet Demir, Shiang Fang, Spencer L. Tomarken, Jason Y. Luo, J. D. Sanchez-Yamagishi, K. Watanabe, T. Taniguchi, E. Kaxiras, R. C. Ashoori & P. Jarillo-Herrero





### **nature** Accelerated Article Preview

#### ARTICLE doi:10.1038/nature26160

Unconventional superconductivity in magic-angle graphene superlattices

Yuan Cao, Valla Fatemi, Shiang Fang, Kenji Watanabe, Takashi Taniguchi, Efthimios Kaxiras & Pablo Jarillo-Herrero



### Strongly correlated systems

#### Article

Superconductivity in metallic twisted bilayer graphene stabilized by WSe<sub>2</sub>

https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-020-2473-8 Harpreet Singh Arora<sup>13,8</sup>, Robert Polski<sup>12,8</sup>, Yiran Zhang<sup>13,8,8</sup>, Alex Thomson<sup>23,4</sup>, Youngjoon Chol<sup>12,9</sup>, Hyunjin Kim<sup>12,9</sup>, Zhong Lin<sup>5</sup>, Jiham Zaky Wilson<sup>6</sup>, Xiaodong Xu<sup>5,6</sup>, Jiun-Haw Chu<sup>4</sup>, Kenji Watanab<sup>2</sup>, Taksahi Taniquchi<sup>1</sup>, Jiason Alicea<sup>23,4</sup> & Stevan Nadi-Perop<sup>13</sup> d: 31 January 2020

#### Nature 583, 579 (2020)



#### Independent superconductors and correlated insulators in twisted bilayer graphene

Yu Saito<sup>1</sup>, Jingyuan Ge<sup>2</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>3</sup>, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>3</sup> and Andrea F. Young<sup>2</sup>





CeRhIn\_

PM

p = 2.5 GPa

SC

3

4

p\*

p (GPa)

3

2

0

0

AF

1

7 (K)

**Cuprate superconductors** 

Pairing due to magnetic fluctuations Variations of the Hubbard model

#### Heavy fermion compounds

Ba(Fe<sub>1-x</sub>Co<sub>x</sub>)<sub>2</sub>As<sub>2</sub> 100 Tet (Y) 50 AFM Ort 0.00 0.02 0.04 0.06 0.08 0.10 0.12

Pnictides

## Superconductivity and strongly correlated phases in carbon compunds

Landau levels

(a) B = 0

### Superconductivity

Stage 1	Stage 2	Stage 3
Graphene laver	0000 Intercalant	0000000000

Graphite intercalation compounds, such as C<sub>6</sub>Ca,  $n \ge 10^{14} \text{ cm}^{-2}$ ,  $T_c \sim 1 - 10 \text{K}$ 



Alkali intercalated fullerenes, such as  $Rb_3C_{60}$ ,  $T_c \sim 10 - 40K$ 

### Renormalization of the Fermi velocity



#### Fractional quantum Hall effect and insulating phase of Dirac electrons in graphene

Xu Du<sup>1</sup><sup>†</sup>, Ivan Skachko<sup>1</sup>, Fabian Duerr<sup>1</sup>, Adina Luican<sup>1</sup> & Eva Y. Andrei<sup>1</sup>

#### Nature 462, 192 (2009)



## **Observation of the fractional quantum Hall effect in graphene**

Kirill I. Bolotin<sup>1</sup>\*†, Fereshte Ghahari<sup>1</sup>\*, Michael D. Shulman<sup>2</sup>, Horst L. Stormer<sup>1,2</sup> & Philip Kim<sup>1,2</sup>

#### Nature 462, 196 (2009)



## Twisted graphene layers: theory

#### PHYSICAL REVIEW B 82, 121407(R) (2010)

Flat bands in slightly twisted bilayer graphene: Tight-binding calculations

E. Suárez Morell, J. D. Correa, P. Vargas, M. Pacheco,\* and Z. Barticevic





#### SICAL REVIEW LETTERS

**Gauge Potentials in Graphene Bilayers** an-Jose,1 J. González,1 and F. Guinea2





Moiré bands in twisted double-layer

Rafi Bistritzer and Allan H. MacDonald<sup>1</sup>





Localization of Dirac Electrons in Rotated

NANO

Graphene Bilayers



are 3 Moiré pattern with  $\theta = 1.16^\circ$  on CVD graphene Tonography taken at 200 mV and 20 nA showing

## Twisted bilayer graphene: Bloch waves



- Wavefunctions at the Dirac points have an internal structure, defined by phases which change at the atomic scale.
- The same wavefunction in one layer is projected onto different wavefunctions in the other layer, depending on the choice of phases.

# Electronic structure





### Brillouin zones





## Low energy bands







Charge density distribution

PHYSICAL REVIEW B 98, 235158 (2018)

Charge-transfer insulation in twisted bilayer graphene

Louk Rademaker<sup>1,2</sup> and Paula Mellado<sup>2,3</sup>



Μ

Κ

## Magic angles and beyond





0.00 k,(A<sup>-1</sup>) 0.02 0.04 -1.0 EimeV

0.00

0.02

k.(Å-1)

PHYSICAL REVIEW B 99, 035111 (2019) Referrer Boggentien Multiple topological transitions in twisted bilayer graphene near the first magic angle Karra Heizz, <sup>1</sup> Churviao Liu, <sup>1</sup> Hassan Sharourian,<sup>2-3</sup> Xiao Chen,<sup>3</sup> and Leon Balents<sup>3</sup> Topological transitions of the second sec

- Additional Dirac points
- Bifurcation of van Hove singularities

Origin of narrow bands

Localized orbitals and complex unit cells

Quasiparticles dressed by excitations

# Twisted bilayer graphene

- No interactions are included
- A plane wave in one layer is transferred to the other layer as a superposition of three waves.
- The hamiltonian is defined by one, or two, dimensionless parameters.
- The energy scales are of order 100 meV



Heavy fermion materials. Compounds with rare earths

electron

## (Some) theoretical models



### Hubbard model



### Wannier functions

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 123, 087602 (2019)

pin-Orbital Density Wave and a Mott Insulator in a Two-Orbital Hubbard Model on a Honeycomb Lattice

Zheng Zhu,<sup>1,2,3</sup> D. N. Sheng,<sup>2,\*</sup> and Liang Fu<sup>1,†</sup>

PHYSICAL REVIEW B 98, 245103 (2018)

Correlations and electronic order in a two-orbital honeycomb lattice model for twisted bilayer graphene

Jörn W. F. Venderbos<sup>1,2</sup> and Rafael M. Fernandes<sup>3</sup>



Landau levels



### Chiral model

PHYSICAL REVIEW RESEARCH 2, 023238 (2020)

Chern bands of twisted bilayer graphene: Fractional Chern insulators and spin phase transition

Cécile Repellin<sup>1,2</sup> and T. Senthil<sup>2</sup>

PHYSICAL REVIEW RESEARCH 2, 023237 (2020)

Fractional Chern insulator states in twisted bilayer graphene: An analytical approach

Patrick J. Ledwith, Grigory Tarnopolsky, Eslam Khalaf, and Ashvin Vishwanath



### Van Hove singularities



# Peaks in the density of states

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 122, 026801 (2019)				
Kohn-Luttinger Superconductivity in Twisted Bilayer Graphene				
I González' and T Stauber				
PHYSICAL REVIEW B 101, 224513 (2020)				
Editors' Suggestion				
Nematic superconductivity in twisted bilayer graphene				

Dmitry V. Chichinadze, Laura Classen, and Andrey V. Chubukov 0

## Local orbitals and Wannier functions

#### PHYSICAL REVIEW B 98, 045103 (2018)

Editors' Suggestion

Model for the metal-insulator transition in graphene superlattices and beyond

Noah F. Q. Yuan and Liang Fu

#### PHYSICAL REVIEW X 8, 031087 (2018)

Maximally Localized Wannier Orbitals and the Extended Hubbard Model for Twisted Bilayer Graphene

Mikito Koshino,<sup>1,\*</sup> Noah F. Q. Yuan,<sup>2</sup> Takashi Koretsune,<sup>3</sup> Masayuki Ochi,<sup>1</sup> Kazuhiko Kuroki,<sup>1</sup> and Liang Fu<sup>2</sup>

PHYSICAL REVIEW X 8, 031088 (2018)

Symmetry, Maximally Localized Wannier States, and a Low-Energy Model for Twisted Bilayer Graphene Narrow Bands

Jian Kang<sup>1,\*</sup> and Oskar Vafek<sup>1,2,†</sup>

PHYSICAL REVIEW X 8, 031089 (2018)

Origin of Mott Insulating Behavior and Superconductivity in Twisted Bilayer Graphene

Hoi Chun Po,1 Liujun Zou,1,2 Ashvin Vishwanath,1 and T. Senthil2

#### PHYSICAL REVIEW B 98, 085435 (2018)

Editors' Suggestion

Band structure of twisted bilayer graphene: Emergent symmetries, commensurate approximants, and Wannier obstructions

Liujun Zou,1,2 Hoi Chun Po,1 Ashvin Vishwanath,1 and T. Senthil2

#### Electronic bands of twisted graphene layers

- Model for Metal-Insulator Transition in Graphene Superlattices and Beyond Authors: Noah F. Q. Yuan, Liang Fu arXiv:1803.09699, Phys. Rev. B 98, 079901 (2018)
- Origin of Mott Insulating Behavior and Superconductivity in Twisted Bilayer Graphene
- Muyar Orupizteri Authors: Hoi Chun Po, Linjun Zou, Ashvin Vishwanath, and T. Senthil arXiv:1803.09742, Phys. Rev. X 8, 031089 (2018)
  S. Symmetry, Maximally Localized Wannier States, and a Low-Energy
- Symmetry, Maximally Localized Wannier States, and a Low-Energy Model for Twisted Bilayer Graphene Narrow Bands Authors: Jan Kang and Oskar Vafek arXiv:1805.04918, Phys. Rev. X 8, 031088 (2018)

 Maximally-localized Wa for the twisted bilay Authors: Mikito Koshi Kazuhiko Kuroki, Lian arXiv:1805.06819, Phys

 Band Structure of T Commensurate App Authors: Liujun Zou, B arXiv:1808.02873. Phys. Journal Club for Condensed Matter Physics A Monthly Selection of Interesting Papers by Distinguished Correspondents

Recommended with a Commentary by Francisco Guinea, Indes

- The underlying structure of the superlattice is a honeycomb lattice.
- The lattice nodes are at the centers of the regions where the stacking is AB aor BA.
- The Wannier functions have maxima at three lobes around the nodes, and non trivial phases.





This description differs significantly from an array of mesoscopic quantum dots in a triangular lattice.

### https://www.condmatjclub.org

## Local orbitals and Wannier functions. Fragile topology

REVIEWS OF MODERN PHYSICS, VOLUME 84, OCTOBER-DECEMBER 2012

#### Maximally localized Wannier functions: Theory and applications

#### Nicola Marzari

Theory and Simulation of Materials (THEOS), École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne, Station 12, 1015 Lausanne, Switzerland

#### Arash A. Mostofi

Departments of Materials and Physics, and the Thomas Young Centre for Theory and Simulation of Materials, Imperial College London, London SW7 2AZ, United Kingdom

#### Jonathan R. Yates Department of Materials, University of Oxford, Parks Road, Oxford OX1 3PH, United Kingdom

Ivo Souza Centro de Física de Materiales (CSIC) and DIPC, Universidad del País Vasco, 20018 San Sebastián, Spain and Ikerbasque Foundation, 48011 Bibao, Spain

#### David Vanderbilt

Department of Physics and Astronomy, Rutgers University, Piscataway,



### The "obstruction"

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 121, 126402 (2018)

Fragile Topology and Wannier Obstructions Hoi Chun Po,<sup>1</sup> Haruki Watanabe,<sup>2</sup> and Ashvin Vishwanath<sup>1</sup> $\lim_{\vec{r}^2 \to \infty} w(\vec{r}) \propto \frac{1}{r^{3/2}}$  $\langle w(\vec{r}) | \vec{r}^2 | w(\vec{r}) \rangle \to \infty$ 

### The Wannier functions are not uniquely defined



#### PHYSICAL REVIEW B 74, 235111 (2006)

#### Insulator/Chern-insulator transition in the Haldane model

T. Thonhauser and David Vanderbilt Department of Physics and Astronomy, Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey, Piscataway, New Jersey 08854, USA (Received 24 August 2006; published 20 December 2006) We study the behavior of several physical properties of the Haldane model as the system undergoes its transition from the normal-insulator to the Chern-insulator phase. We find that the density matrix has expo-

and the precisely at the phase boundary on total spread of the maximally localized Wannier functions is found to diverge in the Chern-insulator phase. Jowever, its gauge-invariant part, related to the localization length of Resta and Sorella, is finite in branchulating phases and diverges as the phase boundary is approved by the Chern-insulator region of the phase diagram.

Singularities in the Berry phase prevent the existence of exponentially localized Wannier functions.

Tunable electron-phonon interactions in long-period superlattices

Hiroaki Ishizuka,<sup>1,2,\*</sup> Ali Fahimniya,<sup>1</sup> Francisco Guinea,<sup>3,4</sup> and Leonid Levitov<sup>1</sup>

#### Nano Lett. 21, 6475 (2021)



## Interactions in twisted bilayer graphene



Number of atoms:	
Moiré unit length:	
Radius of the charge distribution:	
Coulomb energy:	
Intraatomic (Hubbard) repulsion:	
Electron-phonon coupling:	

## Coulomb interactions and screening in twisted graphene bilayers

 $\Gamma$  point

K point

### Angle: $\theta = 1.05^{\circ}$ Moiré unit cell: $L_M \approx 15$ nm



## Bands, wavefunctions



Francisco Guinea<sup>a,b,1,2</sup> and Niels R. Walet<sup>b,1,2</sup>

\*Imdea Nanoscience, 28015 Madrid, Spain; and <sup>b</sup>School of Physics and Astronomy, University of Manchester, Manchester M13 9PL, United Kingdom

Contributed by Francisco Guinea, November 2, 2018 (sent for review June 26, 2018; reviewed by Allan H. MacDonald and Eugene J. Mele

Bilayer graphene twisted by a small angle shows a significant charge modulation away from neutrality, as the charge in the narrow bands near the Dirac point is mostly localized in a frac- electron-phonon interaction on superconductivity; see refs. 35

arXiv:1806.05990 Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. (USA) 115, 13174 (2019)

relaxation (34), since this is a complex problem and will be

discussed separately. We also do not address the role of the

- The charge distribution within the Moiré unit cell depends on the state.
- Away from the neutrality point, the charge is concentrated at the center of the unit cell.
- A non uniform electrostatic potential is induced.



Sketch of the electrostatic potential

### New interactions in twisted bilayers





On the Electron Theory of Metals S. Schubin and S. Wonsowsky Proc. R. Soc. Lond. A 1934 145, doi: 10.1098/rspa.1934.0089, published 2 June 1934 J. Phys. C: Solid State Phys., Vol. 12, 1979. Printed in Great Britain. © 1979

Some types of instabilities in the electron energy spectrum of the polar model of the crystal: II. The criterion of stability of a metallic state

PHYSICAL REVIEW B		WB	VOLUME 41, NUMBER 10	1 APRIL 1990			
Hole superconductivity and the high- $T_c$ oxides							
F. Marsiglio and J. E. Hirsch							
ĺ	41	6435	© 1990 The American Pl	avsical Society			
		0100		lysical society			

 $\tilde{t} \sum \left( c_i^{\dagger} c_j + c_j^{\dagger} c_i \right) \left( n_i + n_j \right) \qquad \tilde{t} \approx V_H$ 

#### PHYSICAL REVIEW X 8, 031087 (2018)

Maximally Localized Wannier Orbitals and the Extended Hubbard Model for Twisted Bilayer Graphene

Mikito Koshino,1,\* Noah F. Q. Yuan,2 Takashi Koretsune,3 Masayuki Ochi,1 Kazuhiko Kuroki,1 and Liang Fu2



Electron assisted hopping

- Assisted hopping term due to electrostatic interactions
- Favorable for superconductivity

#### See also

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 122, 246401 (2019)

Strong Coupling Phases of Partially Filled Twisted Bilayer Graphene Narrow Bands  $Jian Kang^{1,2}$  and Oskar Vafek $^{1,2,1}$ 

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 122, 246402 (2019)

Ferromagnetic Mott state in Twisted Graphene Bilayers at the Magic Angle

Kangiun Seo<sup>1</sup> Valeri N Kotov<sup>2</sup> and Bruno Uchoa<sup>1,\*</sup>

## Shapes and widths of the bands: theory

PHYSICAL REVIEW B 100, 205113 (2019)

Electronic band structure and pinning of Fermi energy to Van Hove singularities in twisted bilayer graphene: A self-consistent approach



 $V_H(AA) - V_H(AB) \approx 5 \text{meV}$ 



(a) ∈=7.5 20 10 E(meV) - 10 - 20 κ М Γ0 1.2

shifted, while the center,  $\Gamma$ , is not.

The bandwidth is increased, although the density of states at the Fermi energy remains high (pinning of van Hove singularities).

Chiral model

(a) 8=1.08\*, n=1

(b) 8=1.08\*, n=2

## Shapes and widths of the bands: theory

#### PHYSICAL REVIEW RESEARCH 3, 013033 (2021)

Nematic topological semimetal and insulator in magic-angle bilayer graphene at charge neutrality

Shang Liu, Eslam Khalaf, Jong Yeon Lee, and Ashvin Vishwanath (a) (b) 0.06 DOS 0.04 (meV) -20 pzpul 0.02 -40 E -60 -20 0 -40  $k_x a_M$  $k_y a_M$ E (meV)

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 124, 097601 (2020) Nature of the Correlated Insulator States in Twisted Bilayer Graphene Ming Xie@ and A.H. MacDonald

#### PHYSICAL REVIEW B 102, 155149 (2020)

Interactions in the 8-orbital model for twisted bilayer graphene

#### M. J. Calderón S\* and E. Bascones S\*



Ground State and Hidden Symmetry of Magic-Angle Graphene at Even Integer Filling Nick Bultinck 0<sup>1,1</sup> Eslam Khalar<sup>2,1</sup> Shang Liu,<sup>2</sup> Shubhayu Chatterjee,<sup>1</sup> Ashvin Vishwanath,<sup>2</sup> and Michael P. Zaletel<sup>1,2</sup>

PHYSICAL REVIEW X 10, 031034 (2020)



Hartree theory calculations of quasiparticle properties in twisted bilayer graphene

Zachary A H Goodwin<sup>®</sup>, Valerio Vitale<sup>®</sup>, Xia Liang<sup>®</sup>, Arash A Mostofi<sup>®</sup> and Johannes Lischner<sup>1</sup><sup>®</sup>

Elec. Struc. **2**, 034001 (2020)



PHYSICAL REVIEW B 100, 045111 (2019)

Many-body effects in twisted bilayer graphene at low twist angles

A. O. Sboychakov,<sup>1,2</sup> A. V. Rozhkov,<sup>1,2,3,4</sup> A. L. Rakhmanov,<sup>1,2,3,5</sup> and Franco Nori<sup>1,6</sup>



PHYSICAL REVIEW B 100, 205114 (2019)

Charge smoothening and band flattening due to Hartree corrections in twisted bilayer graphene



## Shapes and widths of the bands: STM experiments

## Maximized electron interactions at the magic angle in twisted bilayer graphene

Alexander Kerelsky<sup>1</sup>, Leo J. McGilly<sup>1</sup>, Dante M. Kennes<sup>2</sup>, Lede Xian<sup>3</sup>, Matthew Yankowitz<sup>1</sup>, Shaowen Chen<sup>1,4</sup>, K. Watanabe<sup>5</sup>, T. Taniguchi<sup>5</sup>, James Hone<sup>6</sup>, Cory Dean<sup>1</sup>, Angel Rubio<sup>3,7</sup> & Abhay N. Pasunathy<sup>19</sup>

#### Nature 572, 95 (2019)



Charge order and broken rotational symmetry in magic-angle twisted bilayer graphene

Yuhang Jiang<sup>1</sup>, Xinyuan Lai<sup>1</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>2</sup>, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>2</sup>, Kristjan Haule<sup>1</sup>, Jinhai Mao<sup>1,3</sup>\* & Eva Y. Andrei<sup>1</sup>\*

### Nature 572, 91 (2019)



Article

#### Cascade of electronic transitions in magic-angle twisted bilayer graphene

https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-020-2339-0 Dillon Wong<sup>128</sup>, Kevin P. Nuckolls<sup>128</sup>, Myungchui Ch<sup>128</sup>, Biao Lian<sup>18</sup>, Yonglong Xie<sup>1256</sup>, Sangjun Jeon<sup>127</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>4</sup>, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>4</sup>, B. Andrei Bernevig<sup>2</sup> & All Yazdani

#### Nature 582, 198 (2020)



Spectroscopic signatures of many-body correlations in magic-angle twisted bilayer graphene

Yonglong Xie<sup>1</sup>, Biao Lian<sup>2</sup>, Berthold Jäck<sup>1</sup>, Xiaomeng Liu<sup>1</sup>, Cheng-Li Chiu<sup>1</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>3</sup>, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>3</sup>, B. Andrei Bernevie<sup>1</sup> & Ali Yazdani<sup>1</sup>\*

### Nature 572, 101 (2019)



## Electronic correlations in twisted bilayer graphene near the magic angle

oungjoon Chol<sup>13,2</sup>, Jeannette Kemmer<sup>13</sup>, Yang Peng<sup>23,4</sup>, Alex Thomson<sup>23,4</sup>, Harpreet Arora<sup>12</sup>, Robert Polski<sup>13</sup>, Yiran Zhang<sup>012,9</sup>, Hechen Ren<sup>13</sup>, Jason Alicea<sup>13,4</sup>, Gil Refael<sup>23,4</sup>, Felix von Oppen<sup>25</sup>, Kenji Watanabe®, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>6</sup> and Stevan Nad]+Perge<sup>0124</sup>

Nature Phys. 15, 1174 (2019)



## Shapes and widths of the bands: compressibility experiments

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 123, 046601 (2019)

Editors' Suggestion

Electronic Compressibility of Magic-Angle Graphene Superlattices S. L. Tomarken,<sup>1</sup> Y. Cao,<sup>1</sup> A. Demir,<sup>1</sup> K. Watanabe,<sup>2</sup> T. Taniguchi,<sup>2</sup> P. Jarillo-Herrero,<sup>1,\*</sup> and R. C. Ashoon<sup>1,†</sup>





## Electron assisted hopping





6435

© 1990 The American Physical Society

### Electron assisted hopping, a simple model



Editors' Suggestion Featured in Physics

Unconventional superconductivity due to interband polarization

Valentin Crépel<sup>®</sup>,<sup>1</sup> Tommaso Cea,<sup>2</sup> Liang Fu,<sup>1</sup> and Francisco Guinea<sup>2,3,4</sup>





Results

$$g_0 = -\frac{27t^2 V^2}{N_f (\Delta + 3V)^3}$$







Superconductivity







### Screening gives rise to new attractive interactions



#### Hartree potential

$$\Delta_{H} = 3V \sum_{\vec{k},\sigma,\tau \in occ} \left\langle \vec{k},\sigma,\tau \middle| \sigma_{z} \middle| \vec{k},\sigma,\tau \right\rangle$$

The band dispersion depends on the total gap 
$$\widetilde{\Delta}=\Delta+\Delta_{_{\!H}}$$

Twisted bilayer graphene

Hartree potential

$$V_{H}(\vec{r}) = \sum_{\vec{G}} \frac{2\pi e^{2}}{\epsilon \left|\vec{G}\right|} \rho_{\vec{G}} e^{i\vec{G}\vec{r}}$$

$$\rho_{\vec{G}} = \sum_{\vec{k},\sigma,\tau \in occ} \left\langle \vec{k},\sigma,\tau \right| e^{i\vec{G}\vec{r}} \left|\vec{k},\sigma,\tau\right\rangle$$

The band dispersion depends on  $\langle \vec{k}, \sigma, \tau | e^{i\vec{G}\vec{r}} | \vec{k}, \sigma, \tau \rangle$ 

## Exchange term: broken symmetry phases

PHYSICAL REVIEW B 102, 045107 (2020)

Band structure and insulating states driven by Coulomb interaction in twisted bilayer graphene

Tommaso Cea O1 and Francisco Guinea<sup>1,2</sup>

Cascade of phase transitions and Dirac revivals in magic-angle graphene

Nature 582, 203 (2020).

U. Zondiner<sup>15</sup>, A. Rozen<sup>15</sup>, D. Rodan-Legrain<sup>15</sup>, Y. Cao<sup>9</sup>, R. Queiroz<sup>1</sup>, T. Taniguchi<sup>9</sup>, K. Watanabe<sup>+</sup>, Y. Oreg<sup>1</sup>, F. von Oppen<sup>+</sup>, Ady Stern<sup>1</sup>, E. Berg<sup>1</sup>, P. Jarillo-Herrero<sup>152</sup> & S. Ilani<sup>152</sup>



Gapped phase at half filling
Breaks C<sub>2</sub> symmetry



Article

- Spin and/or valley polarized phases near integer fillings
- Metallic. Small Fermi pockets





• Small energy differences



#### Interaction-Enhanced Topological Hall Effects in Strained Twisted Bilayer Graphene

Pierre A. Pantaleón,<sup>1,\*</sup> Võ Tiến Phong,<sup>2,†</sup> Gerardo G. Naumis,<sup>3</sup> and Francisco Guinea<sup>4,5</sup>

### arXiv:2204.09619



### Cascade of phase transitions in twisted bilayer graphene



mature

Chorn insulators yan Hoyo sin



Douglas R. Hartree



Vladimir A. Fock

 The long range Coulomb interaction gives a qualitative explanation of the band deformations, and of the broken symmetry phases of twisted bilayer graphene.

ADTICLE

• It does not identify details of the broken symmetry phases.

## Superconductivity and repulsive interactions









Pairing due to magnetic fluctuations Variations of the Hubbard model

Heavy fermion compounds

**Pnictides** 

>? `



#### Nature 574, 653 (2019)



Nature 583, 579 (2020)



Nature Phys. 16, 926 (2020)

### Superconductivity and excitations from a broken symmetry state

# Quasiparticles dressed by excitations



Hubbard  $\rightarrow$  t-J model Cuprate oxides



- V. Kozii, H. Isobe, J. W. F. Venderbos, and L. Fu, *Nematic superconductivity stabilized by density wave fluctuations: Possible application to twisted bilayer graphene*, Phys. Rev. B 99, 144507 (2019).
- Y.-Z. You and A. Vishwanath, *Superconductivity from valley fluctuations and approximate so(4) symmetry in a weak coupling theory of twisted bilayer graphene*, npj Quantum Materials **4**, 16 (2019).
- J. Y. Lee, E. Khalaf, S. Liu, X. Liu, Z. Hao, P. Kim, and A. Vishwanath, *Theory of correlated insulating behavior and spin-triplet superconductivity in twisted double bilayer graphene*, Nature Comm. **10**, 5333 (2019).
- F. Wu and S. Das Sarma, *Collective excitations of quantum anomalous hall ferromagnets in twisted bilayer graphene*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **124**, 046403 (2020).
- E. Khalaf, N. Bultinck, A. Vishwanath, and M. P. Zaletel, *Soft modes in magic angle twisted bilayer graphene*, arXiv:2009.14827 (2020),
- G. Sharma, M. Trushin, O. P. Sushkov, G. Vignale, and S. Adam, *Superconductivity from collective excitations in magic-angle twisted bilayer graphene*, Phys. Rev. Research 2, 022040 (2020).
- A. Kumar, M. Xie, and A. H. MacDonald, *Lattice Collective Modes from a Continuum Model* of Magic-Angle Twisted Bilayer Graphene, arXiv:2010.05946 (2020).
- M. Christos, S. Sachdev, and M. S. Scheurer, *Correlated insulators, semimetals, and superconductivity in twisted trilayer graphene*, (2021), arXiv:2106.02063.
- H. Dai, J. Hou, X. Zhang, Y. Liang, and T. Ma, *Mott insulating state and d + id superconductivity in an abc graphene trilayer*, Phys. Rev. B 104, 035104 (2021).
- S. Chatterjee, T.Wang, E. Berg, and M. P. Zaletel, *Intervalley coherent order and isospin fluctuation mediated superconductivity in rhombohedral trilayer graphene*, arXiv:2109.00002 (2021).
- Z. Dong, L. Levitov, *Superconductivity in the vicinity of a spin polarized state in a cubic Dirac band*, arXiv:2109.01133 (2021).

## Long range interactions and superconductivity: the Kohn-Luttinger mechanism

# Some results which describe pairing channels using perturbative/diagrammatic analyses of the Coulomb interaction

• H. Isobe, N. F. Q. Yuan, and L. Fu, *Unconventional superconductivity and density waves in twisted bilayer graphene*, Phys. Rev. X **8**, 041041 (2018).

• Y. Sherkunov and J. J. Betouras, *Electronic phases in twisted bilayer graphene at magic angles as a result of van hove singularities and interactions*, Phys. Rev. B **98**, 205151 (2018).

- J. González and T. Stauber, *Kohn-Luttinger superconductivity in twisted bilayer graphene*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **122**, 026801 (2019).
- B. Roy and V. Juricic, *Unconventional superconductivity in nearly flat bands in twisted bilayer graphene*, Physical Review B **99**, 12 1407 (2019).

• D. V. Chichinadze, L. Classen, and A. V. Chubukov, *Nematic superconductivity in twisted bilayer graphene*, Phys. Rev. B **101**, 224513 (2020).

• Y.-P. Lin and R. M. Nandkishore, *Parquet renormalization group analysis of weak-coupling instabilities with multiple high-order van hove points inside the Brillouin zone*, Phys. Rev. B **102**, 245122 (2020).

• C. Lewandowski, D. Chowdhury, and J. Ruhman, *Pairing in magic-angle twisted bilayer graphene: role of phonon and plasmon umklapp*, (2020), arXiv:2007.15002.

• W. Qin, B. Zou, and A. H. MacDonald, *Critical magnetic fields and electron-pairing in magic-angle twisted bilayer graphene*, (2021), arXiv:2102.10504.

• C. Lewandowski, S. Nadj-Perge, and D. Chowdhury, *Does filling-dependent band renormalization aid pairing in twisted bilayer graphene?*, (2021), arXiv:2102.05661.

to long-range effects.

## Superconductivity from repulsive interactions: interband transition



FIG. 1. Types of particle-particle interaction diagrams up to the second order which contribute to the irreducible scattering vertex.



Activating superconductivity in a repulsive system by high-energy degrees of freedom

Zhiyu Dong and Leonid Levitov

### arXiv:2103.08767



## Low energy excitations and charge excitations: Electron-hole pairs, plasmons, and phonons



- Longitudinal phonon with displacements of the same sign in the two layers. Coupling through the deformation potential, *D*=20 eV.
- Longitudinal phonons with displacements of opposite sign do not induce global charge modulations.
- Transverse phonons couple to the velocity operator.

## Longitudinal phonons and electron-hole pairs

## Coulomb interaction, phonons, and superconductivity in twisted bilayer graphene

Tommaso Cea<sup>a,b</sup> and Francisco Guinea<sup>a,c,d,1</sup>



$$\tilde{g} \approx \frac{D^2}{\lambda + 2\mu} \frac{\mathcal{N}}{WL^2} \approx 0.4$$

D = 20 eV $\lambda + 2\mu \approx 20 \text{ eV}\text{Å}^{-2}$  $\mathcal{N} = 4$  $W \approx 10 \text{ meV}$  $L^2 \approx (140 \text{ Å})^2$ 

## Repulsive interactions and pairing

#### **RPA** resummation



- Longitudinal phonons modify the susceptibility.
- The bare interaction is the repulsive Coulomb coupling



FIG. 1. Types of particle-particle interaction diagrams up to the second order which contribute to the irreducible scattering vertex.

#### NEW MECHANISM FOR SUPERCONDUCTIVITY\*

W. Kohn

University of California, San Diego, La Jolla, California

and

J. M. Luttinger

#### Phys. Rev. Lett. 15, 524 (1965)

We also mention that since the electronphonon interaction is screened by the same kind of mechanism, it too should contribute to long-range effects.



$$\widetilde{\Delta}_{\alpha,\beta}^{m_1,m_2}\left(\vec{k}\right) = \sum_{n_1,n_2,\vec{q}} \Gamma_{n_1,n_2,\alpha,\beta}^{m_1,m_2}\left(\vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q}\right) \widetilde{\Delta}_{\alpha,\beta}^{n_1,n_2}\left(\vec{k}+\vec{q}\right)$$
$$\mathcal{M}_{\vec{g}}\left(\vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q}\right) = \int d^2\vec{r} \, u_{\vec{k}}^*(\vec{r}) e^{i\vec{G}\vec{r}} u_{\vec{k}+\vec{q}}(\vec{r})$$

$$\begin{split} \Gamma_{n_{1},n_{2},\alpha,\beta}^{m_{1},m_{2}}\left(\vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q}\right) &= -\frac{1}{\Omega}\sum_{\vec{c}_{1},\vec{c}_{1}'}\sum_{\vec{c}_{2},\vec{c}_{2}'}\sum_{i_{1},i_{2}}\mathcal{V}_{\vec{c}_{1}-\vec{c}_{1}'}^{scr}\left(\vec{q}\right)\mathcal{M}_{\vec{c}_{1}-\vec{c}_{1}'}^{*}\left(\vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q}\right)\mathcal{M}_{\vec{c}_{2}-\vec{c}_{2}'}\left(\vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q}\right) \\ \times \sqrt{\frac{f\left(-E_{m_{2},-\vec{k},\beta}}+\mu\right)-f\left(E_{m_{1},\vec{k},\alpha}-\mu\right)}{E_{m_{2},-\vec{k},\beta}+E_{m_{1},\vec{k},\alpha}-2\mu}}}\sqrt{\frac{f\left(-E_{n_{2},-\vec{k}-\vec{q},\beta}+\mu\right)-f\left(E_{n_{1},\vec{k}+\vec{q},\alpha}-\mu\right)}{E_{m_{2},-\vec{k}-\vec{q},\beta}+E_{m_{1},\vec{k}+\vec{q},\alpha}-2\mu}} \end{split}$$

## Results: critical temperature

#### Critical temperatures



Bands, densities of states, magic angle



Dependence on dielectric constant





Critical temperature with and without e-ph interaction

Superconductivity in a doped valley coherent insulator in magic angle graphene: Goldstone-mediated pairing and Kohn-Luttinger mechanism Vladyslav Kozii,<sup>1,2</sup> Michael P. Zaletel,<sup>1,2</sup> and Nick Bultinck<sup>1,3</sup>

#### arXiv:2005.12961

Using  $\varepsilon_F = 3.2$  meV and  $\lambda \approx 0.08$ , one finds  $T_c \approx 1.3 \times 10^{-4}$  K, which is too low compared to the experimental values of  $T_c \approx 0.3$  K. However, because of the

Critical temperature for e-e interaction only

- The critical temperature is significantly enhanced by the electron-phonon interaction.
- Superconductivity correlates with the density of states at the Fermi level.
- The effect of external screening depends on the strength of the electron-phonon interaction.

## Nature of the pairing interaction

Electronic susceptibility:  

$$\chi_{\vec{G},\vec{G}}, (\vec{q},\omega) = \sum_{\alpha,\beta,\vec{k}} \left[ \mathcal{M}_{\vec{G}}^{\alpha,\beta} \left( \vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q} \right) \right]^* \mathcal{M}_{\vec{G}'}^{\alpha,\beta} \left( \vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q} \right) \frac{n_{\vec{k}+\vec{q}}^{\beta} - n_{\vec{k}}^{\alpha}}{\omega - \epsilon_{\vec{k}+\vec{q}}^{\beta} + \epsilon_{\vec{k}}^{\alpha}}$$
Form factor:  $\mathcal{M}_{\vec{G}}^{\alpha,\beta} \left( \vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q} \right) = \left\langle \vec{k},\alpha \left| e^{i\vec{G}\vec{r}} \right| \vec{k}+\vec{q},\beta \right\rangle$ 
Superconducting kernel:  $\Gamma_{\alpha,\beta} \left( \vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q} \right)$ 

- Umklapp processes are crucial.
- Form factors lead to attractive interactions.
- The order parameter does not change sign.
- Consistent with spin singlet/valley triplet or spin triplet/valley singlet superconductivity.


## Other effects

 Transverse acoustical and optical phonons are not included.

Possible enhancement of T<sub>c</sub>.

 No exchange effects. Spin and/or valley polarized phases not considered.

> Calculation approximately correct for spin polarized phases with equal occupancy of the K and K' valleys, such as the 2+2 phase near v=2. No soft spin and/or valley modes.

No retardation effects.

Upper bound on the critical temperature,  $k_B T_c \leq \hbar \omega_{ph}$ .

# Superconducting properties

Mechanism intrinsic to twisted bilayer graphene. Multigap superconductor.

No sign changes in the order parameter within eack valley.

Weak pair breaking due to elastic scattering.







## Flat bands and interactions in a graphene trilayer on a substrate



# Evidence of a gate-tunable Mott insulator in a trilayer graphene moiré superlattice

Guorui Chen<sup>®1,2,3</sup>, Lili Jiang<sup>1</sup>, Shuang Wu<sup>4</sup>, Bosai Lyu<sup>3,5</sup>, Hongyuan Li<sup>3,5</sup>, Bheema Lingam Chittari<sup>6</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>®7</sup>, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>7</sup>, Zhiwen Shi<sup>®3,5</sup>, Jeil Jung<sup>®6</sup>, Yuanbo Zhang<sup>2,3,8</sup>\* and Feng Wang<sup>® 19,10\*</sup>

## Nature Phys. 15, 237 (2019)



**Correlated Superconducting and Insulating States in Twisted** 

Trilayer Graphene Moiré of Moiré Superlattices

Kan-Ting Tsai<sup>1†</sup>, Xi Zhang<sup>1†</sup>, Ziyan Zhu<sup>2</sup>, Yujie Luo<sup>1</sup>, Stephen Carr<sup>2</sup>, Mitchell Luskin<sup>3</sup>, Efthimios

Kaxıras<sup>2, 4</sup>, Ke Wang<sup>1</sup>\*

# Signatures of tunable superconductiv graphene moiré superlattice

Guorui Chen<sup>1,2,13</sup>, Aaron L. Sharpe<sup>3,4,13</sup>, Patrick Gallagher<sup>1,2</sup>, Ilan T. Rosen<sup>3,4</sup>, Eli J. Fox<sup>4,5</sup>, Lili Hongyuan Li<sup>6,7</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>8</sup>, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>8</sup>, Jeil Jung<sup>9</sup>, Zhiwen Shi<sup>6,9</sup>, David Goldh Yuanbo Zhang<sup>1,0,10,48</sup> & Feng Wang<sup>1,2,138</sup>

### Nature **572**, 215 (20<sup>-</sup>





d

PL S

-1.4

-400

 $T^{4}_{(K)}$ 

3.8 -4.0 -6.2

I(nA)

Article Tunable correlated Chern insulator and ferromagnetism in a moiré superlattice

https://sol.org/10/308/y41586-020-2049-7 Beelined: 18 May 2019 David Goldman, 2019 David Goldman, 2019

## Nature 579, 56 (2020)



## Flat bands and interactions in an ABC trilayer on hBN

2D Mater. 8 (2021) 044006

https://doi.org/10.1088/2053-1583/ac1b6

#### **2D** Materials

#### PAPER

Narrow bands, electrostatic interactions and band topology in graphene stacks

Pierre A Pantaleón<sup>1,\*</sup>, Tommaso Cea<sup>1</sup>, Rory Brown<sup>2</sup>, Niels R Walet<sup>2</sup>, and Francisco Guinea<sup>1,3</sup>



## Non interacting bands as function of electrostatic bias





## Upper band

Band dispersion as function of filling. Self consistent results.



Bandwidth of the two central bands



Chern number of the two central bands



Charge densities

## Flat bands and interactions in two graphene bilayers with a twist



## Flat bands and interactions in a AB-AB twisted double bilayer graphene

## 2D Mater. 8 (2021) 044006

https://doi.org/10.1088/2053-1583/ac1b6

#### **2D** Materials

PAPER

Narrow bands, electrostatic interactions and band topology in graphene stacks

Pierre A Pantaleón<sup>1,\*</sup>0, Tommaso Cea<sup>1</sup>0, Rory Brown<sup>2</sup>0, Niels R Walet<sup>2</sup>0 and Francisco Guinea<sup>1,3</sup>0



# Non interacting bands as function of electrostatic bias









Bandwidth of the two central bands



Chern number of the two central bands



Charge densities

Band dispersion as function of filling. Self consistent results.

# Superconductivity in twisted trilayers







## Superconductivity in twisted multilayers

## Ascendance of Superconductivity in Magic-Angle Graphene Multilayers

Yiran Zhang<sup>1,2,3\*</sup>, Robert Polski<sup>1,2\*</sup>, Cyprian Lewandowski<sup>2,3</sup>, Alex Thomson<sup>2,3,4</sup>, Yang Peng<sup>5</sup>, Youngjoon Choi<sup>1,2,3</sup>, Hyunjin Kim<sup>1,2,3</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>6</sup>, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>6</sup>, Jason Alicea<sup>2,3</sup>, Felix von Oppen<sup>7</sup>, Gil Refael<sup>2,3</sup>, and Stevan Nadj-Perge<sup>1,2†</sup>

## arXiv:2112:09270



Magic-Angle Multilayer Graphene: A Robust Family of Moiré Superconductors

Jeong Min Park,<sup>1,\*,†</sup> Yuan Cao,<sup>1,2,\*</sup> Liqiao Xia,<sup>1</sup> Shuwen Sun,<sup>1</sup> Kenji Watanabe,<sup>3</sup> Takashi Taniguchi,<sup>3</sup> and Pablo Jarillo-Herrero<sup>1,†</sup>

## arXiv:2112:10760



## Superconductivity in twisted trilayers: theory

#### PHYSICAL REVIEW B 104, L121116 (2021)

#### Letter

#### Band structure and superconductivity in twisted trilayer graphene

Võ Tiến Phong,1 Pierre A. Pantaleón 3,2 Tommaso Cea 3,2 and Francisco Guinea2,3









# Other theoretical work









# Superconductivity in graphene without a moiré superlattice

T (mK)



n (1012 cm-4

# Isospin magnetism and spin-polarized superconductivity in Bernal bilayer graphene

Haoxin Zhou<sup>1</sup>†, Ludwig Holleis<sup>1</sup>, Yu Saito<sup>1</sup>, Liam Cohen<sup>1</sup>, William Huynh<sup>1</sup>, Caitlin L. Patterson<sup>1</sup>, Fangyuan Yang<sup>1</sup>, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>2</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>3</sup>, Andrea F. Young<sup>1</sup>\*

#### Zhou et al., Science 375, 774–778 (2022) 18 February 2022



## Spin-Orbit Enhanced Superconductivity in Bernal Bilayer Graphene

Yiran Zhang<sup>1,2,3</sup>, Robert Polski<sup>1,2</sup>, Alex Thomson<sup>2,3,4</sup>, Étienne Lantagne-Hurtubise<sup>2,3</sup>, Cyprian Lewandowski<sup>2,3</sup>, Haoxin Zhou<sup>1,2</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>5</sup>, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>5</sup>, Jason Alicea<sup>2,3</sup>, and Stevan Nadj-Perge<sup>1,2†</sup>

## arXiv:2205.05087



## Superconductivity in trilayer graphene without a moiré superlattice: theory

#### PHYSICAL REVIEW B 105, 075432 (2022)

#### Superconductivity from repulsive interactions in rhombohedral trilayer graphene: A Kohn-Luttinger-like mechanism

Tommaso Cea<sup>o</sup> and Pierre A. Pantaleón<sup>o</sup> Imdea Nanoscience, Faraday 9, 28015 Madrid, Spain

Võ Tiến Phong Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Penusylvania, Philadelphia PA 19104, USA

Francisco Guinea Indea Nanoscience, Foraday 9, 28015 Madrid, Spain; Donostia International Physics Center, Pasco Manuel de Lardizábal 4, 20018 San Sebastián, Spain; and Ilerbusque, Basque Icandiation for Science, 48009 Bilbao, Spain







## Superconductivity in bilayer graphene without a moiré superlattice: theory

Spin-triplet superconductivity at the onset of isospin order in biased bilayer graphene

Zhiyu Dong<sup>1</sup>, Andrey V. Chubukov<sup>2</sup>, Leonid Levitov<sup>1</sup>

### arXiv:2205.13353



Enhanced superconductivity through virtual tunneling in Bernal bilayer graphene coupled to  $\rm WSe_2$ 

Yang-Zhi Chou,<sup>1,\*</sup> Fengcheng Wu,<sup>2,3</sup> and Sankar Das Sarma<sup>1</sup>

#### arXiv:2206.09922



PHYSICAL REVIEW B 105, L100503 (2022)

#### Acoustic-phonon-mediated superconductivity in Bernal bilayer graphene

Yang-Zhi Chou<sup>0</sup>,<sup>1,\*</sup> Fengcheng Wu<sup>0</sup>,<sup>2</sup> Jay D. Sau,<sup>1</sup> and Sankar Das Sarma<sup>1</sup>



## Superconductivity in bilayer graphene without a moiré superlattice: model



Continuum model





## Screened interaction



Fermi surface and critical temperature





Effect of spin orbit coupling

## STM spectroscopy of the superconducting phase

# Evidence for unconventional superconductivity in twisted bilayer graphene

https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-021-04121-x Received: 16 June 2021

Article

Myungchul Oh¹4, Kevin P. Nuckolls¹4, Dillon Wong¹4, Ryan L. Lee¹, Xiaomeng Liu¹, Kenji Watanabe², Takashi Taniguchi³ & Ali Yazdani¹⊡



#### Spectroscopic Signatures of Strong Correlations and Unconventional Superconductivity in Twisted Trilayer Graphene

Hyunjin Kim,<sup>1,2,3,\*</sup> Youngjoon Choi,<sup>1,2,3,\*</sup> Cyprian Lewandowski,<sup>2,3,4</sup> Alex Thomson,<sup>2,3,4,5</sup> Yiran Zhang,<sup>1,2,3</sup> Robert Polski,<sup>1,2</sup> Kenji Watanabe,<sup>6</sup> Takashi Taniguchi,<sup>6</sup> Jason Alicea,<sup>2,3,4</sup> and Stevan Nadj-Perge<sup>1,2,†</sup>

#### arXiv:2109.12127



Andreev reflection in scanning tunneling spectroscopy of unconventional superconductors

P. O. Sukhachov,<sup>1, \*</sup> Felix von Oppen,<sup>2</sup> and L. I. Glazman<sup>1</sup>

#### arXiv:2208.05979



Andreev reflection spectroscopy in strongly paired superconductors

Cyprian Lewandowski,<sup>1,2</sup> Étienne Lantagne-Hurtubise,<sup>1,2</sup> Alex Thomson,<sup>1,2,3,4</sup> Stevan Nadj-Perge,<sup>5,2</sup> and Jason Alicea<sup>1,2</sup>

## arXiv:2207.09494





f-wave superconductivity. Constant gaps of opposite signs in the two valleys

# Edge modes in f-wave superconducting graphene



## Toy model: graphene + "Haldane" superconducting gap



# Edge modes in f-wave superconducting twisted bilayer graphene





# Tunneling and contact spectra in f-wave superconducting twisted bilayer graphene



Andreev reflection in scanning tunneling spectroscopy of unconventional superconductors

P. O. Sukhachov,<sup>1, \*</sup> Felix von Oppen,<sup>2</sup> and L. I. Glazman<sup>1</sup>

#### arXiv:2208.05979



Andreev reflection spectroscopy in strongly paired superconductors

Cyprian Lewandowski,<sup>1,2</sup> Étienne Lantagne-Hurtubise,<sup>1,2</sup> Alex Thomson,<sup>1,2,3,4</sup> Stevan Nadj-Perge,<sup>5,2</sup> and Jason Alicea<sup>1,2</sup>

#### arXiv:2207.09494



# Tunneling and contact spectra in f-wave superconducting twisted bilayer graphene



Contact regime: BTK limit





Contact regime: Fermi velocity mismatch





## Contact regime: Intervalley scattering





Contact regime: spin-orbit coupling

# Electrons and phonons in twisted bilayer graphene



Niels R. Walet



Tommaso Cea Pierre Pantaleón José Silva-Guillén Yago Ferreiros Andreas Sinner Héctor Sainz-Cruz Alejandro Jimeno Pozo Xueheng Kuang

Also: V. T. Phong (U. Penn) L. Levitov (MIT) L. Fu (MIT) V. Crépel (MIT) S. Yuan (Wuhan U.) J. Lischner, (Imperial C.) Z. Goodwin, (Imperial C.) H. Rostami (Nordita)

de Ma

de Madrid

# Twisted bilayer graphene almost aligned with hBN



FIG. 1. a) Sketch of the moiré superlattice. The blue and orange points represent the carbon atoms, while the green points refer to the substrate. b) The large hexagons represent the BZs of the constituting layers. Their folding gives rise to the mini-BZs represented by the small black hexagons. In the inset: one side of the mini-BZ connects the corners of the BZs of each pair of layers.



PHYSICAL REVIEW B 102, 155136 (2020)

Band structure of twisted bilayer graphene on hexagonal boron nitride

Tommaso Ceao,1,2,\* Pierre A. Pantaleóno,2,\* and Francisco Guinea2,3

- Details of the potential induced by the hBN substrate, beyond spatial averages, matter.
- Near the magic angles, the flat bands are significantly distorted.

Black hexagon: TBG Brillouin Zone. Red hexagon: hBN-TBG Brillouin Zone

# Related works

#### PHYSICAL REVIEW B 102, 035441 (2020)

#### Symmetry breaking in the double moiré superlattices of relaxed twisted bilayer graphene on hexagonal boron nitride

#### Xianqing Lino1.\* and Jun Ni2

<sup>1</sup>College of Science, Zhejiang University of Technology, Hangzhou J10023, People's Republic of China <sup>2</sup>State Key Laboratory of Low-Dimensional Quantum Physics and Frontier Science Center for Quantum Information, Department of Physics, Tsinghua University, Beijing 100084, People's Republic of China

(Received 1 June 2020; revised 15 July 2020; accepted 16 July 2020; published 29 July 2020)



Moiré Commensurability and the Quantum Anomalous Hall Effect in Twisted Bilayer Graphene on Hexagonal Boron Nitride

Jingtian Shi, Jihang Zhu, and A.H. MacDonald

#### Phys. Rev. B 103, 075122 (2021)



#### Quasiperiodicity, band topology, and moiré graphene

Dan Mao and T. Senthil

#### Phys. Rev. B 103, 115110 (2021)



Electron-hole asymmetry and band gaps of commensurate double moire patterns in twisted bilayer graphene on hexagonal boron nitride

> Jiseon Shin, Youngju Park, and Bheema Lingam Chittari Department of Physics, University of Seoul, Seoul 02504, Korea

> > il Jung\*

#### Phys. Rev. B **103**, 075423 (2021)



# Narrow bands and strains



#### PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 127, 126405 (2021)

Heterostrain Determines Flat Bands in Magic-Angle Twisted Graphene Layers

Florie Mesple,<sup>1,\*</sup> Ahmed Missaoui,<sup>2</sup> Tommaso Cea,<sup>3,4</sup> Loic Huder,<sup>5</sup> Francisco Guinea,<sup>3,6</sup> Guy Trambly de Laissardière<sup>0</sup>,<sup>2</sup> Claude Chapelier,<sup>1</sup> and Vincent T. Renard<sup>01,†</sup>



## Non linear Hall effect is metals with non trivial bands



 $J_{bulk}$ 

(c)i

## LETTER

https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-018-0807-6

## Observation of the nonlinear Hall effect under time-reversal-symmetric conditions

Qiong Ma<sup>1,13</sup>, Su-Yang Xu<sup>1,13</sup>, Huitao Shen<sup>1,13</sup>, David MacNeill<sup>1</sup>, Valla Fatemi<sup>1</sup>, Tay-Rong Chang<sup>2</sup>, Andrés M. Mier Valdivia<sup>1</sup>, Santeng Wu<sup>1</sup>, Zongzheng Du<sup>1,4,5</sup>, Chuang -Han Hao<sup>67</sup>, Shiang Fang<sup>2</sup>, Quinn D. Gibson<sup>4</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>0</sup>, Takawi I taniguchi<sup>10</sup>, Robert J. Caw<sup>2</sup>, Elthimios Karis<sup>26,14</sup>, Hai Zhou Lui<sup>14</sup>, Hisi Lin<sup>6</sup>, Tiang Fu<sup>1</sup>, Mu Gelik<sup>1,4</sup> & Fabio Janillo - Herrero<sup>14</sup>

## Nature 565, 337 (2019)



Tunable large Berry dipole in strained twisted bilayer graphene

Pierre A. Pantaleón<sup>1</sup>,<sup>\*</sup> Tony Low<sup>2</sup>, and Francisco Guinea<sup>1,3</sup>

## Phys. Rev. B 103, 205403 (2021)



Interaction-Enhanced Topological Hall Effects in Strained Twisted Bilayer Graphene

Pierre A. Pantaleón,<sup>1,\*</sup> Võ Tiến Phong,<sup>2</sup> Gerardo G. Naumis,<sup>3</sup> and Francisco Guinea<sup>1,4</sup>



Giant second-order nonlinearity of chiral Bloch electrons in twisted bilayer graphene

Junxi Duan<sup>1,2</sup>, Yu Jian<sup>1,2</sup>, Yang Gao<sup>3</sup>, Huimin Peng<sup>1,2</sup>, Jinrui Zhong<sup>1,2</sup>, Qi Feng<sup>1,2</sup>, Yugui Yao<sup>1,2</sup>

#### arXiv:2201.09274





Berry curvature dipole senses topological transition in a moiré superlattice

Subhajit Sinha<sup>11</sup>, Pratap Chandra Adak<sup>11</sup>, Atasi Chakraborty<sup>2</sup>, Kamal Das<sup>2</sup>, Koyendrila Debnath<sup>3</sup>, L. D. Varma Sangani<sup>1</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>4</sup>, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>5</sup>, Umesh V. Waghmare<sup>3</sup>, Amit Agarwal<sup>2\*</sup>, and Mandar M. Deshmukh<sup>1\*</sup>

#### arXiv:2204.02848



## Twisted (chiral) phonons

week ending 3 NOVEMBER 2006

#### PHYSICAL REVIEW B 75, 045404 (2007)

#### Electron-phonon coupling and Raman spectroscopy in graphene

A. H. Castro Neto ment of Physics, Boston University, 590 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215, USA

Francisco Guinea

Strain-driven chiral phonons in two-dimensional hexagonal materials

Habib Rostami,<sup>1</sup> Francisco Guinea,<sup>2, 3, 4</sup> and Emmanuele Cappelluti<sup>5</sup>



PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS

PRL 97, 187401 (2006)

mi,<sup>1</sup> Francisco Guinea,<sup>2,3,4</sup> and Emi arXiv:2022.04909



K phonons in graphene stacks

## Twisted (chiral) phonons, theory

#### PHYSICAL REVIEW X 9, 041010 (2019)

Valley Jahn-Teller Effect in Twisted Bilayer Graphene

M. Angeli<sup>0</sup>,<sup>1</sup> E. Tosatti,<sup>1,2,3</sup> and M. Fabrizio<sup>1</sup>

Eur. Phys. J. Plus (2020) 135:630 https://doi.org/10.1140/epjp/s13360-020-00647-7 Regular Article

Jahn–Teller coupling to moiré phonons in the continuum model formalism for small-angle twisted bilayer graphene

Mattia Angeli<sup>®</sup><sup>(i)</sup>, Michele Fabrizio

(a)

(b) <sub>A1</sub>

 $\stackrel{0}{R_x(nm)}$ 







- Coupling to valley degree of freedom
- Flat folded bands

## Twisted phonons, magic angles



- Coupled Dirac phonons in a twisted background
- Hamiltonian similar to the electronic Hamiltonian
- Multiple interference processes
- Similar phonons in twisted hBN and twisted TMD's

## Electrons and phonons in twisted bilayer graphene

- The largest interaction in twisted graphene bilayers near magical angles is the long range Coulomb interaction. Away from the neutrality point, the inhomogeneous distribution of carriers leads to an electrostatic potential.
- The narrow bands are very fragile, and they are substantially changed by interactions, the substrate, strains, ...
- The non trivial topology of the bands enhance non linear effects, like the non linear Hall effect.

comunidad de Madrid

• There are also narrow phonon bands with non trivial topology.



Niels R. Walet





Tomasso Cea





### **Rory Brown**











Also: V. T. Phong (U. Penn) L. Levitov (MIT) L. Fu (MIT) V. Crépel (MIT) S. Yuan (Wuhan U.)

H. Rostami (Nordita)



Twisted bilayer graphene is a unique material
There is a large number of open problems

## Long range interactions and superconductivity: the Kohn-Luttinger mechanism

# Some results which describe pairing channels using perturbative/diagrammatic analyses of the Coulomb interaction

• H. Isobe, N. F. Q. Yuan, and L. Fu, *Unconventional superconductivity and density waves in twisted bilayer graphene*, Phys. Rev. X **8**, 041041 (2018).

• Y. Sherkunov and J. J. Betouras, *Electronic phases in twisted bilayer graphene at magic angles as a result of van hove singularities and interactions*, Phys. Rev. B **98**, 205151 (2018).

- J. González and T. Stauber, *Kohn-Luttinger superconductivity in twisted bilayer graphene*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **122**, 026801 (2019).
- B. Roy and V. Juricic, *Unconventional superconductivity in nearly flat bands in twisted bilayer graphene*, Physical Review B **99**, 12 1407 (2019).

• D. V. Chichinadze, L. Classen, and A. V. Chubukov, *Nematic superconductivity in twisted bilayer graphene*, Phys. Rev. B **101**, 224513 (2020).

• Y.-P. Lin and R. M. Nandkishore, *Parquet renormalization group analysis of weak-coupling instabilities with multiple high-order van hove points inside the Brillouin zone*, Phys. Rev. B **102**, 245122 (2020).

• C. Lewandowski, D. Chowdhury, and J. Ruhman, *Pairing in magic-angle twisted bilayer graphene: role of phonon and plasmon umklapp*, (2020), arXiv:2007.15002.

• W. Qin, B. Zou, and A. H. MacDonald, *Critical magnetic fields and electron-pairing in magic-angle twisted bilayer graphene*, (2021), arXiv:2102.10504.

• C. Lewandowski, S. Nadj-Perge, and D. Chowdhury, *Does filling-dependent band renormalization aid pairing in twisted bilayer graphene?*, (2021), arXiv:2102.05661.

to long-range effects.

## Static screened potential



• Effective attraction at distances smaller than the size of the unit cell



# Pairing interaction

**RPA** resummation



$$\widetilde{\Delta}_{\alpha,\beta}^{m_1,m_2}\left(\vec{k}\right) = \sum_{n_1,n_2,\vec{q}} \Gamma_{n_1,n_2,\alpha,\beta}^{m_1,m_2}\left(\vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q}\right) \widetilde{\Delta}_{\alpha,\beta}^{n_1,n_2}\left(\vec{k}+\vec{q}\right)$$
$$\mathcal{M}_{\vec{G}}\left(\vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q}\right) = \int d^2\vec{r} \, u_{\vec{k}}^*(\vec{r}) e^{i\vec{G}\vec{r}} u_{\vec{k}+\vec{q}}\left(\vec{r}\right)$$

$$\begin{split} & \Pi_{n_{1},n_{2},\alpha,\beta}^{m_{1},m_{2}}\left(\vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q}\right) = -\frac{1}{\Omega} \sum_{\vec{G}_{1},\vec{G}_{1}'} \sum_{\vec{G}_{2},\vec{G}_{2}'} \sum_{i_{1},i_{2}} \mathcal{V}_{\vec{G}_{1}-\vec{G}_{1}'}^{scr}\left(\vec{q}\right) \, \mathcal{M}_{\vec{G}_{1}-\vec{G}_{1}'}^{*}\left(\vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q}\right) \, \mathcal{M}_{\vec{G}_{2}-\vec{G}_{2}'}\left(\vec{k},\vec{k}+\vec{q}\right) \\ & \times \sqrt{\frac{f\left(-E_{m_{2},-\vec{k},\beta}+\mu\right) - f\left(E_{m_{1},\vec{k},\alpha}-\mu\right)}{E_{m_{2},-\vec{k},\beta}+E_{m_{1},\vec{k},\alpha}-2\mu}} \sqrt{\frac{f\left(-E_{n_{2},-\vec{k}-\vec{q},\beta}+\mu\right) - f\left(E_{n_{1},\vec{k}+\vec{q},\alpha}-\mu\right)}{E_{m_{2},-\vec{k}-\vec{q},\beta}+E_{m_{1},\vec{k}+\vec{q},\alpha}-2\mu}} \end{split}$$

# The calculations



- Pairing between electrons in different valleys.
- Consistent with either spin singlet/valley triplet or spin triplet/valley singlet superconductivity.
- Bands calculated using the Hartree approximation.
- Instantaneous interactions.
- Convergent results as function of number of bands, and of the number of Umklapp processes.

## Results: critical temperature

## Critical temperatures



Bands, densities of states, magic angle



## Dependence on dielectric constant



Critical temperature for e-e interaction only



## Critical temperature with and without e-ph interaction

Superconductivity in a doped valley coherent insulator in magic angle graphene: Goldstone-mediated pairing and Kohn-Luttinger mechanism

Vladyslav Kozii,<sup>1,2</sup> Michael P. Zaletel,<sup>1,2</sup> and Nick Bultinck<sup>1,3</sup>

### arXiv:2005.12961

Using  $\varepsilon_F = 3.2$  meV and  $\lambda \approx 0.08$ , one finds  $T_c \approx 1.3 \times 10^{-4}$  K, which is too low compared to the experimental values of  $T_c \approx 0.3$  K. However, because of the

- The critical temperature is significantly enhanced by the electron-phonon interaction.
- Superconductivity correlates with the density of states at the Fermi level.
- The effect of external screening depends on the strength of the electron-phonon interaction.

## **Results: order parameter**



Phase



magic angle

- At the magic angle, all states contribute to the order parameter
- For other angles, the order parameter is localized near the Fermi surface.
- The order parameter takes different values in different pockets.



## Angle dependence
## Nature of the pairing interaction



- Umklapp processes are crucial.
- Form factors lead to attractive interactions.
- The order parameter does not change sign.
- Consistent with spin singlet/valley triplet or spin triplet/valley singlet superconductivity.



Distribution of the matrix elements of the superconducting kernel

## Other effects

- Transverse acoustical and optical phonons are not included.
   Possible enhancement of T<sub>c</sub>.
- No exchange effects. Spin and/or valley polarized phases not considered.

Calculation approximately correct for spin polarized phases with equal occupancy of the K and K' valleys, such as the 2+2 phase near v=2. No soft spin and/or valley modes.

No retardation effects.

Upper bound on the critical temperature,  $k_B T_c \leq \hbar \omega_{ph}$ .

## Superconducting properties

Mechanism intrinsic to twisted bilayer graphene. Multigap superconductor.

No sign changes in the order parameter within each valley.

Weak pair breaking due to elastic scattering.







# Superconductivity in twisted trilayers

Article

ttps://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-021-03192-0

Tunable strongly coupled superconductivity in magic-angle twisted trilayer graphene

### Nature | Vol 590 | 11 February 2021 | 249

Pablo Jarillo-Herrero<sup>122</sup>

Jeong Min Park<sup>1,4</sup>, Yuan Cao<sup>1,4</sup>™, Kenji Watanabe², Takashi Taniguchi<sup>3</sup> &





#### SUPERCONDUCTIVITY

Electric field-tunable superconductivity in alternating-twist magic-angle trilayer graphene

Zeyu Hao<sup>1</sup>\*, A. M. Zimmerman<sup>1</sup>\*, Patrick Ledwith<sup>1</sup>, Eslam Khalaf<sup>1</sup>, Danial Haie Najafabadi<sup>1</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>2</sup>, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>3</sup>, Ashvin Vishwanath<sup>1</sup>, Philip Kim<sup>1</sup>†

#### Hao et al., Science 371, 1133-1138 (2021) 12 March 2021





Large Pauli Limit Violation and Reentrant Superconductivity in Magic-Angle Twisted Trilayer Graphene

> Yuan Cao,<sup>1, \*, †</sup> Jeong Min Park,<sup>1, \*, †</sup> Kenji Watanabe,<sup>2</sup> Takashi Taniguchi,<sup>2</sup> and Pablo Jarillo-Herrero<sup>1, †</sup>

### arXiv:2103.12083

# Superconductivity in twisted trilayers

Article

ttps://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-021-03192-0

Tunable strongly coupled superconductivity in magic-angle twisted trilayer graphene

### Nature | Vol 590 | 11 February 2021 | 249

Pablo Jarillo-Herrero<sup>122</sup>

Jeong Min Park<sup>1,4</sup>, Yuan Cao<sup>1,4</sup>™, Kenji Watanabe², Takashi Taniguchi<sup>3</sup> &





#### SUPERCONDUCTIVITY

Electric field-tunable superconductivity in alternating-twist magic-angle trilayer graphene

Zeyu Hao<sup>1</sup>\*, A. M. Zimmerman<sup>1</sup>\*, Patrick Ledwith<sup>1</sup>, Eslam Khalaf<sup>1</sup>, Danial Haie Najafabadi<sup>1</sup>, Kenji Watanabe<sup>2</sup>, Takashi Taniguchi<sup>3</sup>, Ashvin Vishwanath<sup>1</sup>, Philip Kim<sup>1</sup>†

#### Hao et al., Science 371, 1133-1138 (2021) 12 March 2021





Large Pauli Limit Violation and Reentrant Superconductivity in Magic-Angle Twisted Trilayer Graphene

> Yuan Cao,<sup>1, \*, †</sup> Jeong Min Park,<sup>1, \*, †</sup> Kenji Watanabe,<sup>2</sup> Takashi Taniguchi,<sup>2</sup> and Pablo Jarillo-Herrero<sup>1, †</sup>

### arXiv:2103.12083



Twisted bilayer graphene is a unique material
There is a large number of open problems



Niels R. Walet











10 – 40 meV

acks





## hopping



